

February 23, 2024



**MINUTES OF THE RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE**

**These minutes are supplemented by the audio recording that is posted online at:
<https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents>.**

Honorable Board of Directors
Golden Gate Bridge, Highway
and Transportation District

Honorable Members:

The Rules, Policy, and Industrial Relations Committee/Committee of the Whole (Committee) of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) met in regular session in the Board Room, Administration Building, Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, San Francisco, CA, on Friday, February 23, 2024, at 9:00 a.m., with Chair Hernández presiding. A remote audio option for public participation was available.

- (1) **Call to Order:** 9:00 a.m.
- (2) **Roll Call:** Senior Board Analyst Elizabeth Eells.

Committee Members Present (7): Chair Hernández; Vice Chair Moulton-Peters; Directors Garbarino, Grosboll, Hill and Pahre; President Cochran.

Committee Members Absent (2): Directors Conroy and Thier.

Other Directors Present (5): Directors Giudice, Mastin, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Thériault.

Committee of the Whole Members Present (12): Directors Garbarino, Giudice, Grosboll, Hernández, Mastin, Moulton-Peters, Pahre, Rodoni and Thériault; Second Vice President Rabbitt; First Vice President Hill; President Cochran.

Committee of the Whole Members Absent (7): Directors Conroy, Dorsey, Engardio, Safaí, Snyder, Stefani and Thier.

Staff Present: General Manager Denis Mulligan; Acting Auditor-Controller and Budget and Electronic Revenue Director Jennifer Mennucci; District Engineer Ewa Bauer-Furbush; Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong; Attorney Kimon Manolius; Deputy General Manager/Bridge Division David Rivera; Deputy General Manager/Bus Transit Division Les Belton; Deputy General Manager/Ferry Division Michael Hoffman; Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper; Executive Administrator to the General Manager Justine Bock; Senior Board Analyst Elizabeth Eells.

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
FEBRUARY 23, 2024/PAGE 2

Copies of all reports are available on the District's web site at <https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents/> or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

(3) Follow-Up to Compensation Study Findings [00:44 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper presented the staff report, which was for informational purposes only and no action was taken.

[03:58 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Chair Hernández thanked Ms. Hopper for the report. She expressed support for follow up staff actions to: 1) create a Compensation Policy to help guide staff to set compensation; and, 2) address the compensation of the positions that are shown to be “significantly out of sync with the employment marketplace” in the Compensation Study as outlined in the staff report on page 3.

Mr. Mulligan responded that staff would be pleased to develop and bring a draft Compensation Policy, including salary adjustments, back to the Committee and Board.

Director Grosboll also requested staff address the positions listed in the staff report. In addition, he requested that staff recommend an appropriate percentage range for salaries to differ from the average.

Mr. Mulligan verified that staff understands the Committee wants the compensation for the positions that are so different from the average to be addressed in the near future. He clarified that a thoughtful Compensation Policy could take some time and could apply to everyone.

Director Mastin asked if any agencies have policies related to positions being over compensated. He requested additional information about the District's position that was shown to be more than the average.

Mr. Mulligan responded that the District did identify a position that was significantly over the average and did take steps to reduce the salary.

President Cochran requested further information regarding the position whose salary was shown to be over the average.

Mr. Mulligan stated that the staff member's salary was reduced because the duties had significantly changed over time. The staff member agreed to the salary decrease and is still employed by the District.

Director Hill asked if salary and benefits are included in compensation. He also asked if CalPERS health insurance benefit savings would be calculated into total compensation.

Mr. Mulligan responded that the Compensation Study includes salary, benefits and health insurance savings.

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
FEBRUARY 23, 2024/PAGE 3

Director Thériault expressed reservations about a universal Compensation Policy for employees who are represented and unrepresented. He expressed concern about how a Compensation Policy would be received in labor bargaining.

Mr. Mulligan said that staff would take all Board input into account.

Chair Hernández asked if the Compensation Study includes represented as well as unrepresented positions.

Mr. Mulligan responded that the Compensation Study includes represented and unrepresented positions, and is appreciated by those in represented positions.

In response to Director Thériault's comments, Director Rabbitt said that the County of Sonoma does not have a Compensation Policy for the reasons cited by Director Thériault. He expressed his view that policy comes out of labor negotiations and confirmed Sonoma County does have a goal of being within 5% of average compensation. He commented about the competitive nature and challenges of staff recruitment. He inquired about higher vacancy rates in District positions. He also inquired about the possibility of resetting salaries for those positions that have remained vacant for a longer period of time.

Mr. Mulligan confirmed that the District has had some recent success with 'hard to fill' positions.

Director Garbarino commented about the expense of replacing staff. She said that she has found paying people 5 to 10% over the average can be an effective recruitment tool and outlined a number of events they regularly organize and host.

Mr. Mulligan added that the District has found effective recruitment tools include vanpools and buses as well as placing more emphasis on the salary component of compensation.

Director Moulton-Peters offered to share the results of Marin Transit's Compensation Subcommittee Study.

Director Pahre suggested that staff contact Sonoma Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) for information about its Compensation Study.

Mr. Mulligan stated that staff would follow up.

Chair Hernández expressed appreciation for the Committee's discussion and encouraged Directors to continue to provide input to staff. She stated that she believes the District has to recognize the contributions and value of its employees. She said she looks forward to having staff return to adjust those salaries that were found to be significantly under average, and at a later time, present a draft Compensation Policy.

[21:40 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

The following individual spoke under public comment:

- David Pilpel, San Francisco resident (remotely)