



Agenda Item No. (4)

To: Building and Operating Committee/Committee of the Whole  
Meeting of March 21, 2024

From: John R. Eberle, Deputy District Engineer  
Ewa Z. Bauer-Furbush, District Engineer  
Denis J. Mulligan, General Manager

Subject: **APPROVE ACTIONS RELATIVE TO AWARD OF CONTRACT NO. 2023-F-073, SAN FRANCISCO FERRY TERMINAL PHYSICAL SECURITY IMPROVEMENTS, TO VALENTINE CORPORATION**

### **Recommendation**

The Building and Operating Committee recommends that the Board of Directors approve the following actions relative to award of Contract No. 2023-F-073, *San Francisco Ferry Terminal Physical Security Improvements*, as follows:

1. Approve award of Contract No. 2023-F-073, to Valentine Corporation, of San Rafael, CA in the amount of \$797,369; and,
2. Establish a construction contingency for Contract No. 2023-F-073 in the amount of \$119,605 equal to 15% of the contract award amount;

with the understanding that sufficient funds are available in the FY 23/24 Ferry Division Capital Budget for the Project #2251, *SFFT Security Improvements Project* to finance these actions.

This matter will be presented to the Board of Directors at its March 22, 2024, meeting for appropriate action.

### **Summary**

The Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) operates the Golden Gate Ferry on four (4) ferry routes connecting Marin County and the City and County of San Francisco: the San Francisco/Larkspur route, the San Francisco/Sausalito route, the San Francisco/Angel Island route, and the San Francisco/Tiburon route.

The Golden Gate San Francisco Ferry Terminal (SFFT) is located behind the San Francisco Ferry Building and consists of the Golden Gate Ferry Terminal ticket building, passenger restrooms buildings, utility buildings, passenger waiting plaza, passenger boarding platforms, and vessel berths.

In 2004, in response to a security assessment of the District’s ferry facilities performed after the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001, the District constructed security improvements at its ferry facilities. At the SFFT, the improvements included installation of fences, gates, steel bollards, and security cameras.

The original scope of the project included tall fencing around the west side of the facility, but this fencing was rejected by the Port of San Francisco (Port) and the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission due to visual and aesthetic concerns.

In recent years, the security measures installed at SFFT in 2004 were found insufficient to keep intruders from entering the passenger waiting plaza and passenger boarding platforms, especially during the non-operational hours. To improve security of the SFFT, in 2020, the District applied for the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) Port Security Grant Program (PSGP) and, in 2021, received grant funding to implement the additional security measures at SFFT.

Contract No. 2023-F-073, *San Francisco Ferry Terminal Physical Security Improvement*, will enhance security of the terminal both during operational and non-operational hours. The project involves, in general, the following work:

- Replacement of concrete barrier and tubular steel fencing with concrete planter barriers;
- Installation of overhead electric coil grille gates at the terminal ingress;
- Addition of ballistic resistant aluminum curtain walls above the existing walls at the terminal east side to close the four feet opening;
- Modification of the existing steel bollards; and,
- Relocation of existing benches and bicycle racks.

On January 30, 2024, the bid solicitation documents were posted on Bonfire, the District’s public procurement portal. In addition, the solicitation was advertised three times in the San Francisco Examiner and the Small Business Exchange. A courtesy message notifying disadvantaged and small businesses was sent to approximately 837 email addresses. Nine firms downloaded the solicitation documents from the District’s procurement portal. On the bid opening date of February 27, 2024, one bid was received, opened, and publicly read:

<u>COMPANY</u>	<u>TOTAL BID PRICE</u>
1. Valentine Corporation, San Rafael, CA	\$797,369.00

The Engineering staff, Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Program Office, and Attorney evaluated the bid proposal based upon the criteria that was specified in the bid solicitation.

Engineering staff performed a cost analysis of the bid, comparing the bid pricing to the engineer’s estimate prepared prior to the contract being advertised for bids. The construction bid proposal is approximately 12% higher than the engineer’s estimate, primarily due to higher cost for electrical work associated with the overhead electrical grille gates and site demolition work. Engineering staff also reached out to a number of firms that downloaded the bid solicitation documents but did not submit bids and determined that various business reasons accounted for the lack of a bid submission, such as they were busy with other projects, they did not have the resources to work on this project and that they had difficulties securing bids from subcontractors. None of the reasons provided were related to the specifications being too restrictive or limiting competition.

Engineering staff has determined that the bid from the Valentine Corporation reflects the current market conditions for such work, that Valentine Corporation’s pricing for the work is fair and reasonable, and awarding the Contract to Valentine Corporation is in the District’s best interest.

A Small Business Enterprise (SBE) contract-specific goal of 13% was established for this contract. Bidders were required to document their activities in the solicitation and selection process of subcontractors, sub-consultants, and suppliers to ensure that this process was carried out in a nondiscriminatory manner. The DBE Program Office Administrator has determined that Valentine Corporation has complied with the DBE/SBE Program requirements applicable to this contract. Valentine Corporation is certified as a Small Business for the Purpose of Public Works. At this time, SBE participation of 52.7% is anticipated during the performance of this contract.

The Engineering staff and Attorney reviewed the bid proposal for completeness and conformance with the bid solicitation requirements and determined that Valentine Corporation, with a bid price of \$797,369.00, is a responsive and responsible bidder. Staff recommends the award of Contract No. 2023-F-073 to Valentine Corporation.

It is recommended that a contingency in an amount of \$119,605, or 15% of the construction contract’s total price, be established for Contract No. 2023-F-073 considering the possibility of unforeseen circumstances arising during construction of this Project.

**Fiscal Impact**

Project # 2251, *SFFT Security Improvements*, is included in the FY 23/24 Ferry Division Capital Budget in the amount of \$1,500,000 and is funded with 67% Federal (FEMA/PSGP), 23% San Francisco Proposition K funds, and 10% District funds. The budget of Project #2251 is sufficient to finance the project construction as presented in Table 1 below.

**TABLE 1: PROJECT BUDGET – #2251, SFFT Security Improvements**

<b><u>PROJECT BUDGET ITEM</u></b>	<b><u>COST</u></b>
<b>Design</b>	
District Staff Burdened Labor Costs – Design and Bid Documents	\$113,354
Indirect Costs (ICAP) on District Staff Burdened Labor - Estimated	59,840
Design Consultant (Electrical Consultant)	2,500
Miscellaneous Project Expenses (advertising, filings, etc.)	10,442
Permits and Fees (Port of SF Permits)	17,856
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$203,992</b>
<b>Construction</b>	
Construction Contract No. 2023-F-073	\$797,369
Construction Contract Contingency (15%)	119,605
Construction Engineering (Electrical Consultant)	1,500
Construction Administration – District Staff Burdened Labor	231,500
Indirect Costs (ICAP) on District Staff Burdened Labor - Estimated	121,417
General Project Expenditures	14,617
Material Testing Consultant	10,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$1,296,008</b>
<b>TOTAL BUDGET</b>	<b>\$1,500,000</b>

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK